

## APPELBAUM DRAWS IN MALONE DEBATE

Three Hours of Free Speech,  
Mostly by Audience of Equal-  
ly Divided Partisans.

### ISSUES LOST IN HUBBUB

Socialist Contender Fails Even  
to Rebut Argument of Hu-  
manitarian Cult.

Miss E. Appelbaum, officer of Mayor Mitchell, and Dudley Field Malone, champion of Morris Hillquit, engaged a political debate before 1,455 members of the Humanitarian Cult and 1,457 Socialists at Carnegie Hall last night. At the outset the audience without a dissenting vote agreed that without free speech life is a dull and dreary affair indeed. During the following three hours the audience continued to insist upon their right to free speech. Their insistence taking the form of an outpouring of cheers, screeches, catcalls, yells, boos and hoots, the like of which has seldom if ever been heard north of an African jungle.

Never, indeed, while the two speakers were begging the voters for a hearing did feeling run lower than six feet on the level. Marvellous as was the collection of noise, it was not novel by the fact that throughout the entire evening only one man was thrown out of the building.

After each speaker had stood on the platform for thirty minutes and started sentences that ended only in uproars, the audience was given a chance to catch its breath while several piano selections were played.

Then the audience, clearing its collective throat and wrapping up its programmes once more into meaneophones, prepared to hear the ten minute rebuttals of the speakers. After the rebuttals, the programme said, the audience by a rising vote would determine the winner.

**Verdict Not Announced.**  
Mr. Malone, the first to rebut, stepped to the edge of the platform and thrusting his left hand across a somewhat wilted shirt front told the audience that when the time came for rebuttal he wanted to have something to rebut. He said Mr. Appelbaum had failed to give him anything to answer, thanked the audience and sat down.

Through a storm of hisses, cheers and stamping Mr. Appelbaum started to make reply, but the gallery boomed him to the echo and then with an accord made him out. The rest of the house followed, and history will never know who won the debate. From the sidelines it looked as if Mr. Appelbaum had lost his voice, suffered a wilted collar, a solid shirt boom, had consumed a pint of milk in vain and had won a closer hold upon the Humanitarian Cult, which he founded, organized and leads.

Malone lost several pounds of dignity when he made reply to a heckler who told him Tammany had always taken good care of him, and suffered other setbacks, including a ruined dress shirt, several locks of hair and the undying enmity of the Humanitarian Cult. All in all it looked like a draw.

**Socialists Have One Majority.**

The meeting was the eighty-seventh of the cult. It had been arranged by Mr. Appelbaum, who distributed about half of the seating capacity to the members of his organization—to be exact 1,455 seats. Mr. Malone was given the remainder of the tickets, which totalled 1,457. He sent the tickets to the Hillquit campaign committee, who sent the choice of their rooting undergraduates. The Humanitarian Cult found the going at bit rough at the start, but soon caught the spirit of the quiet affair and during the closing half hour by a sprint showed that even amateurs given the inspiration can be made into first class rosters on short notice.

When all sides finally got into full cry the result as set down by the stenographer was something like this: "Mr. Appelbaum speaking! I want to congratulate Mr. Malone on the progress he has made—[applause]. I remember—[applause]. Folks, you are applauding too early; wait until I finish the sentence [laughter]. Now let us—[Cries of 'Talk about the issues!'] If you will listen I will talk about the—[uproar breaks out in the gallery.]" At the time that B. L. Heinrich, a former member of the Humanitarian Cult, arose and began heckling Mr. Ap-

pelbaum about the conduct of his organization, the nearest approach to unfriendliness between the two debaters broke out. It ran something like this: Mr. Appelbaum—God gave man a tongue and God gave the snake the hissing power. Go up and use it, brother. I am going to stand here, and every moment you hiss I will deduct from my speaking time, and any man that dares be so unkind to Mr. Malone is going to get it from me just as hard.

Mr. Malone—I will take care of myself. Mr. Appelbaum—I am talking now. (At this point Heinrich, from a seat near the stage, leaped to his feet and began to fire questions at the speaker. Uproar rushed down the aisle. The people on the platform rushed to the edge. The ushers fought with Heinrich, who knocked two of them sprawling. He was overpowered after a two minute bout and jerked from the hall and thrown into the street.)

As the fight was going on the record shows: Mr. Malone: Sit down! A voice: Put that man out! Mr. Malone: Let him alone!

**Malone Dodges the Point.**

Mr. Appelbaum: Sit down, folks (turning and appealing to Mr. Malone.) You tell them they must behave like gentlemen.

Mr. Malone: Don't be silly!

Mr. Appelbaum: I am not talking to you!

The chairman (James Ingersoll of South Orange, N. J.): Have they got your goat?

Mr. Appelbaum: I don't think so!

As far as the debate was concerned each speaker revived the arguments presented for and against Hillquit since the campaign opened. They talked of war and of free speech and of the value of annexations and indemnities. Little was said of local issues.

By and large it was the most eventful meeting the Humanitarian Cult ever held. Mr. Malone got into the campaign a little late, but when he took on Mr. Appelbaum he went into the stormiest session the campaign has seen.

**BOY HURT BY HUMANITARIAN CAR.**

Youngster Steps in Front of Machine—Will Recover.

Charles McDonald, 9 years old, of 327 West 100th street, was playing with a number of other boys in front of the election booth in 100th street between West End avenue and Riverside Drive about 5 o'clock yesterday afternoon when he stepped into the street directly in front of an automobile owned by Mrs. Grace Humiston of 20 Fifth avenue and operated by Joseph Kiff of 208 East Twenty-sixth street.

The boy was knocked down and stunned. Kiff put him in the automobile and drove to St. Luke's Hospital, where it was found that the boy had suffered a fracture of the left leg and had been out and bruised about the head and face. He will recover.

**Washington Women Carry Letters.**

WASHINGTON, Nov. 5.—The first women letter carriers ever to be employed by the government will appear on the streets of the capital to-morrow as an experiment by the local post office to meet the shortage of men.

**AS the returns begin to come in, the crowd will start to come out. It will be an Election Night which will take its place in the annals of New York as one of the memorable events of the city's history—its issues looming to proportions of national interest. It will be a scene which you will never forget—as you look down to the pavements from the top of a**

**Fifth Avenue Bus**

**more than 4000 miles of paved motor roads in**

**every day out-of-doors polo-golf-tennis-seashore**

**Four daily California trains via the Santa Fe, including the California Limited; also the Santa Fe de-Luz weekly in winter**

**Grand Harvey serves all the meals—and Grand Canyon is on your way**

**Our booklet tell in detail**

**Geo. C. Pineda, G.P.A., 37 Broadway, New York City**

**Phone 441-1111**

**Price 10c**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

**San Francisco**

## MAYOR WILL WIN BY 70,000 SAY LEADERS

Continued from First Page.

not on "the job" while the votes are being counted.

Thomas F. Smith, secretary of Tammany Hall, said:

"It looks like Hyman by 70,000. It is the old, old story. The people occasionally take a chance and put in a reform Mayor only to find that he is a reformer before rather than after election."

The Socialist managers made this final statement:

"The great vote for Hillquit will be a challenge to these dark forces that are seeking to crush freedom of speech and the press and to undermine under cover of the war the civil liberties which make us American citizens instead of American subjects."

"Our campaign has progressed triumphantly in spite of the vilification and falsehoods of these powerful interests opposed to us."

**"Thug" Charge Falls Flat.**

The Fusion managers stated last night that the attempts of the opposition to connect the Fusion committee with petition frauds and the employment of thugs during the last days of the campaign had failed completely. Speaking of the alleged petition frauds in the Bronx Mr. Buckner, the Mitchell manager, who was summoned before the Bronx Grand Jury yesterday, said:

"The attempt to involve the Fusion committee in any irregularities with reference to nominating petitions proved a farce. It was made clear to the District Attorney and the Grand Jury of Bronx County that no one connected with the Fusion committee had in any way been conscious of or a party to questionable nominating petitions for any minor office in the Bronx."

Mr. Buckner added that the "many arrests" which will be made to-day at the polls for illegal voting will furnish a complete answer to the charge of Mr. Swann that "thugs" and gangsters have been employed by the Fusion committee to intimidate the delicate Tammany voter.

James C. Baum, named in several of the newspapers supporting Mr. Hyman as one of those who have been engaged by the Fusionists to corrupt an army of "strong arm men," yesterday announced that he had instructed his attorneys to file suit against the New York American for \$50,000 for slander.

**Legitimate Detective Agency.**

"I have no connection whatsoever with the hiring of men to work at the polls election day nor do I know one man, let alone 1,000 men, that were hired to do guerrilla work in behalf of the Fusion committee," said Mr. Baum. "I conduct a legitimate detective agency and have for my clients some of the foremost citizens. The Journal did not think I was a strike breaker or a hater of thugs when they retained my agency in 1915 to do some detective work for them."

"In conclusion, I want to say that I have never met or spoken to Mayor

Mitchel in my life, nor did I speak to any of his campaign managers or any one connected with the Fusion committee."

Bishop Robert L. Padlock of eastern Oregon, who during the Van Dyck administration in this city was rector of the Pro-Cathedral in Stanton street, yesterday sent the following message to Mayor Mitchell:

"Remembering unpeakable hellish conditions under Croker, Van Wyck, Devery, believing worse will prevail under Murphy, Hearst, Hyman and the Kaiser, I wish my many friends of the East and West sides would vote for honest, independent, patriotic Mitchell and so help save New York and America in this crisis."

Bishop Padlock cooperated with Dr. Parkhurst during the Van Wyck administration in exposing the white slave and other corruption on the East Side under that Tammany administration.

**"Big Tim" Brother Hits Chief.**

Alderman Patrick H. Sullivan, a brother of the late "Big Tim" Sullivan, who sometime ago deserted Tammany for Mayor Mitchell, last night sent a stinging letter to Charles F. Murphy. He accused the "Chief" of having used Tammany as his own personal organization; of having picked unknown candidates in the face of the wishes of the members of Tammany Hall because he knew he could "own and control" those candidates, and with having ruined every Tammany man who exhibited any independence in the face of the wishes of the members of Tammany Hall because he was supporting Judge Hyman. Mr. Padlock urged all voters of Polish origin to support the Mayor.

The leading automobile men of the city, representing the more prominent makes of cars, declared for the Mayor last night.

With the exception of Judge Hyman all of the other Mayorality candidates will receive the returns to-night at their homes. Judge Hyman will be at the headquarters of the Democratic-Fusion headquarters, 50 East Forty-second street. Mayor Mitchell will receive the returns at his home, the Peter Stuyvesant apartment house, Riverside Drive and Ninety-eighth street. Morris Hillquit, the Socialist candidate, will also remain at his home, 214 Riverside Drive, and William M. Bennett at his home, 234 Central Park West.

**CHINESE SEAMEN TEST LOT.**

Highest Court Holds Ship Line Exempt From Contract Law.

WASHINGTON, Nov. 5.—The Supreme Court to-day held that the contract labor law was not intended to apply to seamen. The decision was on a test case instituted by Paul Scharenberg, a San Francisco labor leader, against the Dollar Steamship Company.

Scharenberg's action was taken to restrict free importation of Chinese labor to man American ships. His specific complaint was the bringing in of nineteen Chinese on a British ship for employment on the Dollar line.

In some quarters a belief was expressed that the decline in quotations might not have been so severe had there been a larger short interest in the market. Short selling, which is considered one of the safety cushions in security markets, is believed to have been

curtailed by the action of the Stock Exchange last week when it ordered all members to file with the Clearing House a list of the stocks they had borrowed for delivery, a list of those they had loaned and the names of the customers for whom they had sold stocks short. The names of the customers are sealed in envelopes and will be known only to the committee on business conduct, which is known as the police committee of the exchange.

This committee began late yesterday to tackle the accumulated envelopes to learn whether there had been any concerted bear raiding of the market in an effort to undermine prices. It is expected that some news of the investigation may be announced late this week.

The unusually low prices to which stocks declined yesterday and a comparison of the high figures for this year are contained in the following tabulation:

**MOTORISTS FOR ADAMSON.**

Prominent Men in Automobile Trade Urge His Election.

An eleventh hour attack on the candidacy of Robert Adamson, Fire Commissioner, Fusion and Republican nominee for President of the Board of Aldermen, by an organization known as the "automobilists" campaign committee, was repelled last night by a group of the most prominent automobile manufacturers in the city, who strongly urged the election of Commissioner Adamson. A statement issued by the automobile men said:

"The undersigned advocate of the automobile trade and to automobile owners the election of Commissioner Adamson as President of the Board of Aldermen, and this effort have over their signatures sent out some 50,000 letters to their customers and friends, giving definite reasons as to why those in the automobile trade and automobile owners should support his candidacy."

Among the signers of the letters are: Carl H. Page, president Carl H. Page & Co., E. S. Hare, president Packard Motor Car Company of New York; John F. Plummer, president Colonial Motors Company; William Poertner, president Poertner Motor Company; William C. Holt, general manager, Willys-Overland, Inc., New York; Clifford M. Bishop, president Bishop, McCormick & Bishop; P. C. Stowers, general sales manager, Lauffman-Morris Company.

**STOCKS HARD HIT AS FINANCIERS CONFER**

Morgan and Exchange Head in Session When New Drive Shakes Market.

NEW LOW LEVELS SET

H. G. S. Noble Says Liquidation Is Genuine and Brokers Call for More Margins.

J. P. Morgan and H. G. S. Noble, president of the New York Stock Exchange, yesterday had an informal conference relative to the break in the stock market and money market conditions. While they were discussing conditions prices of stocks again broke violently from two to as much as ten points to new low levels for the year, and in some instances to the lowest prices since the panic of 1907.

It was learned from a trustworthy source late yesterday that Mr. Morgan and Mr. Noble did not touch on the question of minimum prices.

**"Genuine Liquidation."**

The financial district was much wrought up when the news was published that the confab was under way, but a governor of the Stock Exchange said the informal discussion was over in a very short time, and added that it bore little significance.

Mr. Noble in discussing the drop in market values yesterday said:

"The selling was genuine liquidation. The decline in values was orderly and there was no raiding of the market."

While the decline was one of the most severe that has been witnessed this year, and resulted in many holders of stocks on margin being sold out, there were no rumors of brokerage houses being in trouble. Such reports are usually heard following sharp breaks in stocks, but the loans of brokers are asserted to be unusually small, so that the liquidation of stocks was not due to the calling of loans by the banks.

One banker gave it as his opinion that yesterday's depreciation was in anticipation of the establishment in the not distant future of minimum prices, but others said this was not necessary as it was in 1914.

**Short Selling Curtailed.**

In some quarters a belief was expressed that the decline in quotations might not have been so severe had there been a larger short interest in the market. Short selling, which is considered one of the safety cushions in security markets, is believed to have been

## STOCKS HARD HIT AS FINANCIERS CONFER

Morgan and Exchange Head in Session When New Drive Shakes Market.

NEW LOW LEVELS SET

H. G. S. Noble Says Liquidation Is Genuine and Brokers Call for More Margins.

J. P. Morgan and H. G. S. Noble, president of the New York Stock Exchange, yesterday had an informal conference relative to the break in the stock market and money market conditions. While they were discussing conditions prices of stocks again broke violently from two to as much as ten points to new low levels for the year, and in some instances to the lowest prices since the panic of 1907.

It was learned from a trustworthy source late yesterday that Mr. Morgan and Mr. Noble did not touch on the question of minimum prices.

**"Genuine Liquidation."**

The financial district was much wrought up when the news was published that the confab was under way, but a governor of the Stock Exchange said the informal discussion was over in a very short time, and added that it bore little significance.

Mr. Noble in discussing the drop in market values yesterday said:

"The selling was genuine liquidation. The decline in values was orderly and there was no raiding of the market."

While the decline was one of the most severe that has been witnessed this year, and resulted in many holders of stocks on margin being sold out, there were no rumors of brokerage houses being in trouble. Such reports are usually heard following sharp breaks in stocks, but the loans of brokers are asserted to be unusually small, so that the liquidation of stocks was not due to the calling of loans by the banks.

One banker gave it as his opinion that yesterday's depreciation was in anticipation of the establishment in the not distant future of minimum prices, but others said this was not necessary as it was in 1914.

**Short Selling Curtailed.**

In some quarters a belief was expressed that the decline in quotations might not have been so severe had there been a larger short interest in the market. Short selling, which is considered one of the safety cushions in security markets, is believed to have been

curtailed by the action of the Stock Exchange last week when it ordered all members to file with the Clearing House a list of the stocks they had borrowed for delivery, a list of those they had loaned and the names of the customers for whom they had sold stocks short. The names of the customers are sealed in envelopes and will be known only to the committee on business conduct, which is known as the police committee of the exchange.

This committee began late yesterday to tackle the accumulated envelopes to learn whether there had been any concerted bear raiding of the market in an effort to undermine prices. It is expected that some news of the investigation may be announced late this week.

The unusually low prices to which stocks declined yesterday and a comparison of the high figures for this year are contained in the following tabulation:

**MOTORISTS FOR ADAMSON.**

Prominent Men in Automobile Trade Urge His Election.

An eleventh hour attack on the candidacy of Robert Adamson, Fire Commissioner, Fusion and Republican nominee for President of the Board of Aldermen, by an organization known as the "automobilists" campaign committee, was repelled last night by a group of the most prominent automobile manufacturers in the city, who strongly urged the election of Commissioner Adamson. A statement issued by the automobile men said:

"The undersigned advocate of the automobile trade and to automobile owners the election of Commissioner Adamson as President of the Board of Aldermen, and this effort have over their signatures sent out some 50,000 letters to their customers and friends, giving definite reasons as to why those in the automobile trade and automobile owners should support his candidacy."

Among the signers of the letters are: Carl H. Page, president Carl H. Page & Co., E. S. Hare, president Packard Motor Car Company of New York; John F. Plummer, president Colonial Motors Company; William Poertner, president Poertner Motor Company; William C. Holt, general manager, Willys-Overland, Inc., New York; Clifford M. Bishop, president Bishop, McCormick & Bishop; P. C. Stowers, general sales manager, Lauffman-Morris Company.

**STOCKS HARD HIT AS FINANCIERS CONFER**

Morgan and Exchange Head in Session When New Drive Shakes Market.

NEW LOW LEVELS SET

H. G. S. Noble Says Liquidation Is Genuine and Brokers Call for More Margins.

J. P. Morgan and H. G. S. Noble, president of the New York Stock Exchange, yesterday had an informal conference relative to the break in the stock market and money market conditions. While they were discussing conditions prices of stocks again broke violently from two to as much as ten points to new low levels for the year, and in some instances to the lowest prices since the panic of 1907.

It was learned from a trustworthy source late yesterday that Mr. Morgan and Mr. Noble did not touch on the question of minimum prices.

**"Genuine Liquidation."**

The financial district was much wrought up when the news was published that the confab was under way, but a governor of the Stock Exchange said the informal discussion was over in a very short time, and added that it bore little significance.

Mr. Noble in discussing the drop in market values yesterday said:

"The selling was genuine liquidation. The decline in values was orderly and there was no raiding of the market."

While the decline was one of the most severe that has been witnessed this year, and resulted in many holders of stocks on margin being sold out, there were no rumors of brokerage houses being in trouble. Such reports are usually heard following sharp breaks in stocks, but the loans of brokers are asserted to be unusually small, so that the liquidation of stocks was not due to the calling of loans by the banks.

One banker gave it as his opinion that yesterday's depreciation was in anticipation of the establishment in the not distant future of minimum prices, but others said this was not necessary as it was in 1914.

**Short Selling Curtailed.**

In some quarters a belief was expressed that the decline in quotations might not have been so severe had there been a larger short interest in the market. Short selling, which is considered one of the safety cushions in security markets, is believed to have been

curtailed by the action of the Stock Exchange last week when it ordered all members to file with the Clearing House a list of the stocks they had borrowed for delivery, a list of those they had loaned and the names of the customers for whom they had sold stocks short. The names of